



ASSESSMENT SUMMARY v1.0.0

Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Trusted Lists (ETSI TS 119 612)¹

European Telecommunications Standards Institute (ETSI)²

¹ ETSI TS 119 612 specification:

https://www.etsi.org/deliver/etsi_ts/119600_119699/119612/02.02.01_60/ts_119612v020201p.pdf

² ETSI organisation: <https://www.etsi.org/>

Change Control

Modification		Details
Version 1.0.0		
Initial version		

TABLE OF CONTENT

1. INTRODUCTION..... 4

2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY 4

EIF Interoperability Principles.....4

2.1. EIF Interoperability Layers 7

3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS 9

1. INTRODUCTION

The present document is a summary of the assessment of the **ETSI TS 119 612** carried out by CAMSS using the CAMSS Assessment EIF scenario³. The purpose of this scenario is to assess the compliance of a standard or specification with the European Interoperability Framework (EIF)⁴.

2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY

ETSI TS 119 612 specifies a format and mechanisms for establishing, locating, accessing and authenticating a trusted list (TL) which makes available trust service status information so that interested parties may determine the status of a listed trust service at a given time. It defines the format and semantics of a TL as well as the mechanisms for accessing TLs. It also provides guidance for locating and authenticating TLs.

Moreover, ETSI TS 119 612 can enhance interoperability by establishing standardised protocols, defining common trust models, supporting global and cross-border recognition, and providing guidelines for interoperable signature formats. In addition, ETSI TS 119 612 is being used in the eIDAS project, which focuses on the creation of e-signature services aiming to enable secure cross-border transactions. In this context, the specification is included in e-Signature standards, which are ideal for implementing new security mechanisms without the need for physical accreditation.

Finally, the ETSI TS 119 612 specification was created by ETSI in 2016, as an extension for Electronic Signatures Infrastructure (ESI) family of specifications⁵. In this context, the specification is complementary to other included in the ESI family.

2.1. EIF Interoperability Principles

Interoperability principles are fundamental behavioural aspects that drive interoperability actions. They are relevant to the process of establishing interoperable European public services. They describe the context in which European public services are designed and implemented.

The specification supports the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

- **Subsidiarity and proportionality**

ETSI TS 119 612 is not included in any national catalogue of recommended specifications whose Member State NIF has a high performance on interoperability according to NIFO factsheets⁶.

The specification supports the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

³ CAMSS Assessment EIF Scenario: <https://ec.europa.eu/eusurvey/runner/CAMSSAssessmentEIFScenario6>

⁴ Isa2 programme website: https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/eif_en

⁵ ESI specification history: <https://standards.globalspec.com/std/14387016/EN%20319%20401>

⁶ NIFO Factsheets: <https://interoperable-europe.ec.europa.eu/collection/nifo-national-interoperability-framework-observatory/digital-public-administration-factsheets-2024>

- **Openness**

Since its first publication, there have been many extensions one of which is ETSI TS 119 612, whose version 2.2.1 was released in 2016 when the eIDAS regulation⁷ identified the need to create protocols to develop preservation services for trust service providers.

The ETSI TS 119 612 specification is maintained and developed by the ESI technical committee⁸. In this context, ETSI's Technical Committee on Electronic Signatures and Trust Infrastructures (TC ESI) allows participation through membership or as a direct participant with certain fees. Non-members can attend meetings and contribute, but they cannot vote. ETSI promotes open publication of intermediate materials to gather feedback. They publish annual activity reports on progress and future plans. The ETSI IPR Policy ensures that standards are accessible under Fair, Reasonable, and Non-Discriminatory (FRAND) terms to balance the interests of IPR holders and implementers.

On the other hand, ETSI TS 119 612 provides a common time-stamping protocol and token profiles for a Trusted List Scheme Operator (TLSO) to provide information on the status and history of Trusted Service Provider (TSP) services. Since it has had three major versions it would be acceptable to consider it has a sufficient market acceptance for its use.

- **Transparency**

The specification specifies a format and a mechanism for establishing, locating, accessing and authenticating a trusted list which makes available trust service status information so that interested parties may determine the status of listed trust services at a given time.

- **Reusability**

ETSI TS 119 612 can be applied in any domain and context where the use of the time-stamping protocol is realised. Therefore, the specification is usable beyond any business-specific domain and can be used in any kind of organisation.

- **Technological neutrality and data portability**

ETSI TS 119 612 is part of the Electronic Signatures and Infrastructure (ESI) specifications and relies on related protocols, but it is not technology-specific and can be implemented incrementally with both mandatory and optional attributes. While the specification must generally be followed, some aspects can be adapted to meet specific needs. It also supports extensions, such as scheme-related information, which enhance the implementation. This specification contributes to data

⁷ eIDAS regulation: <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/eli/reg/2014/910/oj/eng>

⁸ ETSI Technical Committee ESI: <https://www.etsi.org/committee/esi>

portability by ensuring trusted digital identities can be used across various services and borders, simplifying access for citizens to online services without needing to recreate their identity.

The specification partially support the principles related to generic user needs and expectations:

- **User-centricity**

The purpose of IPsec is not related to the reuse of information when needed. Therefore this criterion is considered not applicable to the specification.

- **Inclusion and accessibility**

The purpose of ETSI TS 119 612 is not related to enable e-accessibility. Therefore this criterion is not applicable to this specification.

- **Privacy**

ETSI TS 119 612 supports trust services used by public administrations, helping to protect personal data by ensuring secure transactions, strong authentication, and data integrity, though it provides mechanisms for data protection without being exhaustive. It supports digital signatures and other trust services, relying on strong authentication to verify the identities of those involved in transactions, ensuring only authorized individuals can sign or access data. This specification is included in e-signature implementations under the eIDAS regulation, specifically for the establishment, publication, and maintenance of trusted lists.

- **Security**

EU Member States' trusted lists are designed to support the validation of advanced electronic signatures backed by qualified certificates and secure signature creation devices, including trust services accredited to issue qualified certificates. These lists facilitate secure data exchange by ensuring signatures are supported by a qualified certificate and secure signature creation device, guaranteeing data integrity. ETSI TS 119 612 enables secure sharing of data, ensuring that information exchanged between public administrations, organizations, and citizens remains unmodified and trustworthy. The specification establishes security mechanisms like digital signatures to authenticate agents involved in transactions and ensure data authenticity. It defines how digital certificates and public-key infrastructures (PKIs) authenticate entities, ensuring access is granted only to those with valid credentials.

- **Multilingualism**

The specification counts with a specific section that is about Language Support, so it can be determined that is designed to fully support multilingualism.

The specification partially supports the foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations:

- **Administrative Simplification**

ETSI TS 119 612 simplifies the delivery of European public services by requiring Trusted List Scheme Operators (TLSOs) to define, maintain, and implement measures, practices, and policies to ensure the trusted list is accurate, timely, complete, and authentic. The specification is part of e-Signature standards, enabling the implementation of new security mechanisms without physical accreditation. It establishes digital signatures, which improve digital service delivery by allowing secure and easy access to confidential documents. This enables the sharing of sensitive information in a simple and digital way.

- **Preservation of information**

The purpose of ETSI TS 119 612 is not related to the long-term preservation of data. Therefore this criterion is not applicable to the specification.

- **Assessment of effectiveness and efficiency**

There are existing documentation and studies assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of ETSI TS 119 612 together with other specifications. The "eIDAS Regulation and Its Impact on National Legislation: The Case of the Slovak Republic"⁹ study, focuses on the critical analysis of the adopted eIDAS Regulation, its impact on the existing e-signature legislation and the amendments adopted, which are necessary to unify the legal framework for electronic signature of the Member States of the European Union. Moreover, the legal aspects of the e-signature are analysed.

On the other hand, the "On Migrating from Present Identity Management Services to EIDAS"¹⁰ study, exposes a practical implementation of a service similar to eIDAS. This service allows to predict the success of eIDAS at EU level.

2.2. EIF Interoperability Layers

The interoperability model which is applicable to all digital public services includes:

- Four layers of interoperability: legal, organisational, semantic and technical;
- A cross-cutting component of the four layers, 'integrated public service governance';
- A background layer, 'interoperability governance'.

The Specification supports the implementation of digital public services complying with the EIF interoperability model:

- **Interoperability governance**

At the time of elaborating this assessment, this specification is included in the "Data Exchange" and "e-Signature Verification and Validation", "Trust Service Provisioning" and "e-Signature

⁹ "eIDAS Regulation and Its Impact on National Legislation: The Case of the Slovak Republic" study: <https://www.mdpi.com/2076-3387/12/4/187>

¹⁰ "On Migrating from Present Identity Management Services to EIDAS" study: https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-03003-2_16

Creation" ABBs of the Technical View of the current EIRA Library of Interoperability Specifications (ELIS)¹¹.

ETSI TS 119 612 is being used in the eIDAS project, which focuses on the creation of e-signature services aiming to enable secure cross-border transactions.

Finally, ETSI is a European standards development organisation, and as such, all the specifications developed within the organisation are available and can be accessed through its website repository.

- **Legal Interoperability**

ETSI TS 119 612 has been developed by the European Telecommunication Standards Institute (ETSI), an independent, European, not-for-profit, standardisation organisation in the field of information and communications. Therefore, it can be considered as an European Standard.

- **Organisational interoperability**

ETSI TS 119 612 is a component derived from the actions implemented based on the Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 July 2014 on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market¹². This regulation aims to enhance interoperability when it comes to the trust services of e-signatures in the European context.

- **Semantic Interoperability**

There has not been found any community sharing their data and results on national platforms. However, ETSI TS 119 612 indirectly encourages the creation of communities on national platforms through ETSI membership and directives. It also can be found assessed in Connection Europe Facility (CEF) Building Blocks.

¹¹ EIRA Library of Interoperability Specifications (ELIS): <https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/common-assessment-method-standards-and-specifications-camss/solution/elis/release/v610>

¹² Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 July 2014 on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market: https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=uriserv:OJ.L_.2014.257.01.0073.01.ENG

3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS

This section presents an overview of the results of the CAMSS assessments for **ETSI TS 119 612**. The CAMSS “Strength” indicator measures the reliability of the assessment by calculating the number of answered (applicable) criteria. On the other hand, the number of favourable answers and the number of unfavourable ones is used to calculate the “Automated Score” per category and an “Overall Score”.

Category	Automated Score	Assessment Strength	Compliance Level
EIF Principle setting the context for EU actions on interoperability	20/100 (20%)	100%	Ad-hoc
Core interoperability principles	1420/1700 (84%)	100%	Seamless
Principles related to generic user needs and expectations	1120/1200 (93%)	100%	Seamless
Foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations	460/500 (92%)	100%	Seamless
Interoperability layers*	800/1000 (80%)	100%	Sustainable
Overall Score	3120/3800 (82%) ¹³	100%	

**The technical interoperability layer is covered by the criteria corresponding to the core interoperability principle "Openness".*

With an 100% of assessment strength, this assessment can be considered representative of the specification compliance with the EIF principles and recommendations.

The Overall Automated Score of 82% (3120/3800) demonstrates that the specification supports the European Interoperability Framework in the domains where it applies.

¹³ See the “results interpretation” section of the CAMSS Assessment EIF Scenario Quick User Guide:

<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/common-assessment-method-standards-and-specifications-camss/solution/camss-assessment-eif-scenario/results-visualisation-and-interpretation>