



CAMSS ASSESSMENT SUMMARY v1.0.0

ETSI TS 119 614-1 (ESI)¹

European Telecommunications Standards Institute (ETSI)²

¹ ETSI TS 119 614-1 specification:

https://www.etsi.org/deliver/etsi_ts/119600_119699/11961401/01.01.01_60/ts_11961401v010101p.pdf

² ETSI webpage: [ETSI - Welcome to the World of Standards!](https://www.etsi.org/)

Change Control

Modification		Details
Version 1.0.0		
Initial version		

TABLE OF CONTENT

1. INTRODUCTION.....	4
2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY	4
2.1. EIF Interoperability Principles.....	4
2.2. EIF Interoperability Layers	6
3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS	8

1. INTRODUCTION

The present document is a summary of the assessment of the **Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Testing Conformance and Interoperability of Trusted Lists; Part 1: Specifications for testing conformance of XML representation of Trusted Lists** carried out by CAMSS using the CAMSS Assessment EIF scenario³. The purpose of this scenario is to assess the compliance of a standard or specification with the European Interoperability Framework (EIF)⁴.

2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY

The **Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI)** implements the functionality of user authentication. 'Electronic identification' means the process of using person identification data in electronic form uniquely representing either a natural or legal person, or a natural person representing a legal person; 'Authentication' means an electronic process that enables the electronic identification of a natural or legal person, or the origin and integrity of data in electronic form to be confirmed.

2.1. EIF Interoperability Principles

Interoperability principles are fundamental behavioural aspects that drive interoperability actions. They are relevant to the process of establishing interoperable European public services. They describe the context in which European public services are designed and implemented.

The specification does not support the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

- **Subsidiarity and proportionality**

According to the National Interoperability Framework Observatory (NIFO)⁵ factsheets, ETSI TS 119 614-1 is not included within the national catalogue of any Member States.

The specification partially supports the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

- **Openness**

ETSI TS 119 614-1 is not related to the publication of public data as open data. The development process has been developed by ETSI so all stakeholders can formally appeal and/or raise objections to the development and approval of specifications but it requires fees and membership approval.

The ETSI and any of its committees, in charge of the development of ETSI TS 119 614-1, operate under the ETSI Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs) and IPR Policy. The specification is licensed on a royalty-free basis.

³ EIF Scenario: https://ec.europa.eu/eusurvey/runner/EIFScenario_v510

⁴ EIF: https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/eif_en

⁵ NIFO factsheets: <https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/national-interoperability-framework-observatory-nifo/nifo-factsheets>

The specification is mature enough as it has 2 years of maturity and can be proof that demonstrates it has overcome possible difficulties.

- **Transparency**

ETSI TS 119 614-1 can contribute and promote the visibility of administrations, as it has been focused on testing the Trusted Lists established on web services and their schema according to the requirements established in ETSI TS 119 612.

Unfortunately, the purpose of ETSI TS 119 614-1 is not related to enabling the exposure of interfaces of public administration's services.

- **Reusability**

ETSI TS 119 614-1 is a business domain agnostic specification and therefore can be used and implemented in any domain.

- **Technological neutrality and data portability**

ETSI TS 119 614-1 is a set of conformance testing practices for electronic signatures and preservation and is intended to support the development and manufacture of different solutions at EU level. The specification is intentionally not linked to any software development technology and is also intentionally agnostic on implementation strategies. This is one of the reasons why the test assertions set includes tests on the correctness of the structure of all elements specified by the XML Schemas associated with ETSI TS 119 612.

- **User-centricity**

There is no reference to ETSI TS 119 614-1 and a European use case explicitly stating that the specification allows relevant information and data to be reused.

- **Inclusion and accessibility**

The specification is focused on testing implementation of Trusted List according to ETSI TS 119 612, meaning the specification neither addresses e-accessibility nor prevents it.

- **Security and privacy**

ETSI TS 119 614-1 unfortunately is not related to the secure exchange of data, although it does address data security and trustworthy data processing. In the specification's reference document, there is a list of referenced documents necessary for the application of the specification, among those documents is included the "Secure Hash Standard (SHS)" that enables secure processing of data.

- **Multilingualism**

There is a testing section within the specification which is about Testing multilingual string types. The Predicate of that Test is the value of the lang attribute which specifies the language of the message.

The specification partially supports the foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations:

- **Administrative Simplification**
By testing the requirements established in ETSI TS 119 612, which aims to enable a trusted list for validating the status of services, the specification can help to enhance and upgrade the delivery of digital public services.
- **Preservation of information**
No evidence nor disclosures have been found in the specification regarding fostering or harming the long-term preservation of information.
- **Assessment of effectiveness and efficiency**
After researching there has been no success finding any assessments about ETSI TS 119 614-1 effectiveness.

2.2. EIF Interoperability Layers

The interoperability model which is applicable to all digital public services includes:

- Four layers of interoperability: legal, organisational, semantic and technical;
- A cross-cutting component of the four layers, 'integrated public service governance';
- A background layer, 'interoperability governance'.

The Specification supports the implementation of digital public services complying with the EIF interoperability model:

- **Interoperability governance**
ETSI TS 119 614-1 is already associated with an EIRA ABB in the EIRA Library Of Specifications (ELIS⁶). More specifically, the specification uses the ABB's "Data Quality Component" and "Data Quality Service".
- **Legal Interoperability**
The rules on European standardisation allow the European Commission to identify information and communication technology (ICT⁷) technical specifications - that are not national, European or international standards - to be eligible for referencing in public procurement. ETSI TS 119 614-1 is

⁶ ELIS:

<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/common-assessment-method-standards-and-specifications-camss/solution/elis/release/v110>

⁷ ICT Technical Specifications:

https://ec.europa.eu/growth/single-market/european-standards/ict-standardisation/ict-technical-specifications_en

a European standard, delivered by a European Standardisation organisation (ETSI), according to the specification documentation.

The positive evaluation of ETSI TS 119 614-1 and its identification in European Regulations respond positively to this criterion.

- **Organisational Interoperability**

The purpose of ETSI TS 119 614-1 is not related to the facilitation of modelling business processes, therefore it does not promote or hinder it.

- **Semantic Interoperability**

The specification is supporting the implementation of eIDAS regulation. Therefore, European organisations in charge of public services are prone to share and improve shared public services and the results of applying them.

3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS

This section presents an overview of the results of the CAMSS assessments for **ETSI EN 119 614-1**. The CAMSS “Strength” indicator measures the reliability of the assessment by calculating the number of answered (applicable) criteria. On the other hand, the number of favourable answers and the number of unfavourable ones is used to calculate the “Automated Score” per category and an “Overall Score”.

Category	Automated Score	Assessment Strength	Compliance Level
EIF Principle setting the context for EU actions on interoperability	20/100 (20%)	100%	Ad-hoc
Core interoperability principles	1540/2100 (73%)	85%	Sustainable
Principles related to generic user needs and expectations	400/500 (80%)	60%	Sustainable
Foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations	280/500 (56%)	100%	Essential
Interoperability layers*	980/1100 (89%)	82%	Seamless
Overall Score	2520/3600 (70%) ⁸	84%	

**The technical interoperability layer is covered by the criteria corresponding to the core interoperability principle "Openness".*

With an 84% of assessment strength, this assessment can be considered representative of the specification compliance with the EIF principles and recommendations.

The Overall Automated Score of 70% (2520/3600) demonstrates that the specification does not fully support the European Interoperability Framework in the domains where it applies.

⁸ See the “results interpretation” section of the CAMSS Assessment EIF Scenario Quick User Guide:

<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/common-assessment-method-standards-and-specifications-camss/solution/camss-assessment-eif-scenario/results-visualisation-and-interpretation>